College-wide Benefits Committee  
Minutes of the Meeting  
September 15, 2010

Present
Fran Chandler, Co-Chair    Lenore Banders
Marcy Wade, Co-Chair    Linda Sinclair
Al Vasquez    Sherri Lee-Lewis
Dennis Frisch    Willis Barton

Absent
Anna Rojas

Assistants
Vanna Ratnaransy, HR Analyst-Leaves & Benefits
Laurie Heyman, HR AA-III-Confidential

The meeting was called to order at 1:34 pm.

Approval of the Minutes
Minutes for the meeting of June 23, 2010 –
Approval moved by Dennis Frisch
Seconded by Lenore Banders
Approved: 7
Abstained: 1 (due to absence from meeting on June 23, 2010)

Old Business
Discussion of Long Term Care Insurance tabled to October 13 or Nov 10, 2010;
Vanna Ratnaransy to develop comparisons of providers and offerings.

Hiring of consultant based on Resolution on Scope of Work for Benefits Consultant
Adopted Unanimously by Benefits Committee on May 05, 2010:

Motion: That Committee recommends hiring Fickewirth & Associates as Consultant
Moved by: Dennis Frisch
Seconded by Willis Barton

Discussion:
The motion was made in light of the fact that Fickewirth has worked with the District, knows the District while the other two vendors did not have or have had minimal experience with community colleges.

It was pointed out that the consultant must be mutually agreed upon by the District and the Committee, and that Fickewirth was not mutually agreed upon by the District.
Comments supporting Fickewirth by FA and CSEA representatives:
- Fickewirth was most convincing, more impressive, seems like they would do a better job
- Agreement with previous comment
- Fickewirth was very direct, patterned their responses after our resolution; they know community colleges; aware of cost – their fee was $23-35,000 for 3 months of work; sensitive to timelines; trust issue, directed their campaign to the committee
- Agreement with most of the comments, however, at the end of the Fickewirth presentation, they brought up the VEBA option, and this is a way for them to make a lot of money in this district

The Committee decided that it was too soon to discuss this motion as presented and decided to pull the motion. Mover withdrew motion, accepted by second.

Further discussion:

Re: Fickewirth & Associates:
- Most important concerns regarding Fickewirth by District representatives:
  - Cost
  - Length of time
  - Approach should be ‘even handed’
  - Prior project was too lengthy and not cost efficient
- The addition of the VEBA was probably as an alternative to the HRA and is not something the District is interested in. Other examples of alternatives, such as a cash bonus, should probably have been more clearly stated by the committee.
- Advantage of Fickewirth is its experience with community colleges

FA and CSEA concerns related to Aon and Mercer were as follows:
- Lack of significant experience with community colleges
- Lack of experience with Santa Monica College
- Lack of trust in their ability to provide a trustworthy product
- Lack of SMC focus in their somewhat canned presentations

Suggestion: Would Dr. Tsang meet with the committee for the purpose of asking him to reconsider his position on Fickewirth? We have heard the District’s concerns, we can respond to them by developing a resolution that is very specific as to the scope of work and timelines for the work.

Motion by Dennis Frisch
Second by Marcia Wade

Committee to recommend hiring Fickewirth & Associates based on the Resolution on Scope of Work for Benefits Committee as adopted on May 05, 2010

Vote on Motion:
Ayes: 5
No: 3
Abstention: 0  
Motion died for lack of 2/3 +1 (Quorum of 8 needs 5.416 +1 to pass)  

In an effort to determine committee interest in other consultants, a motion was made by Willis Barton to recommend Aon. 
No Second  

In an effort to determine committee interest in other consultants, a motion was made by Willis Barton to recommend Mercer  
No Second  

2:30pm Al Vasquez left for another meeting.  

Committee directed the co-chairs to refine the following details concerning the use of Fickewirth and Associates as consultants to the Benefits Committee:  
  o Scope of work must be very defined  
  o Detailed time frame of each portion of work  
  o Educational component is necessary for people to understand the change  

Committee agrees to empower both co-chairs to meet with Dr. Tsang to alleviate his concerns about hiring Fickewirth and Associates as consultants to the Benefits Committee.  

Meeting adjourned approximately 2:55pm.  

Next Meeting:  
  Wednesday, Nov. 10, 2010, 1:30pm-3:00pm HSS 301  
  Wednesday, Dec. 01, 2010, 1:30pm-3:00pm BUS 111